

REQUEST FOR BOARD ACTION

To: ESD Board of Education
From: ESD Chief Academic Officer, Kim Moore
Date: August 5, 2024
Business Date: August 12, 2024
Subject: 9.7 Library Sensitive Topic Protocol and Book Lists

Recommendation

Approve protocol and book lists as presented.

Background and Findings:

During the 2023-24 school year, the Board Curriculum Review Committee (BCRC), worked to develop a protocol regarding handling books that may contain sensitive topics. The BCRC drafted a protocol that would provide guidelines for identifying books and creating a sensitive topic book catalog that would be available to parents. The protocol also provides an option for parents to opt their children out from being able to check out identified books. It also provides guidance that parents will receive an email if their child does check a book that is identified as being in the sensitive topic list.

The BCRC also worked during the spring to identify books that should be flagged in Destiny that contain sensitive topics. The list should be reviewed and approved by the BOE before books are flagged in Destiny.

Members of the BCRC also identified books that were considered to contain highly sensitive topics and suggested these be further scrutinized by public review and determined if they should remain in the library collection. These books are suggested to be offered for public review and then a determination made by the board as to whether they should be weeded from the library collection. The list of identified books is attached along with a suggested public input form that will accompany the public display in the district office.



Elizabeth School District Library Services Guiding Protocols

The Elizabeth School District's mission is to provide students with excellent learning opportunities that inspire a passion for learning, develop individual potential, and prepare them for a successful future. This requires access to resources facilitating such passion and interest. Additionally, Elizabeth School District believes that parental involvement and community collaboration are equally necessary to ensure students' most effective educational services pursuant to the District's educational philosophies and goals. To that end, the Board Curriculum Review Committee, and pursuant to District policy, has developed the following guiding protocols to ensure a consistent, transparent, and balanced approach to library services.

Purpose of Library Services

Library services in the Elizabeth School District aim to ensure students have access to age-appropriate materials necessary to facilitate the district's mission of providing students with excellent learning opportunities that inspire a passion for learning.

System of Transparency

The system of transparency within the Elizabeth School District library system is anchored in three primary protocols: a well-defined and consistent process for the ongoing analysis of resources and obtaining future materials, parental access to their student's circulation history and the library registry, and a notification system to inform parents and guardians of materials their students is attempting to access which have been flagged for sensitive content.

Library materials include any print or nonprint materials that are available to students for general use through the District schools' libraries and classrooms, including books, e-books, material available in a digital library database, streaming videos, sound recordings, periodicals, newspapers, applications and subscription content in any form, along with any films or videos in any format.

Protocol 1 - Analysis and Selection Process

This protocol, in conjunction with related District policies, is established to ensure the review of library materials in the District is conducted in a manner that promotes the educational needs and values of the community and considers age-appropriateness. It seeks to ensure transparency in the management of library materials in the District and aims to promote openness and accountability in providing access to educational resources for students and the school community.

- Library and/or district staff as well as members of the BCRC will evaluate existing library materials for potential age-level sensitive content using the following

resources: Goodreads, Trigger Warning Database, Book Trigger Warnings, booklooks.org, and/or Junior Library Guild. Staff will also evaluate any parent/guardian identified books of concern which are brought to the BCRC or district administration for review. Although any flag for sensitive content will be considered for age-level appropriateness, special attention will be given to: graphic violence, sexual content, profanity/obscenity, ideations of self-harm or mental illness, religious viewpoints, drug or excessive alcohol use, racism/discrimination. Materials reviewed and flagged may be purchased if the school principal confirms that such library materials will contribute to the attainment of course objectives directly related to Board-adopted academic standards. However, these materials will be considered for labeling as sensitive content and reported to the BCRC in the annual library services summary, or as otherwise required.

- All materials maintained and purchased by schools are to facilitate the district's mission of providing students with excellent learning opportunities that inspire a passion for learning, developing individual potential, and preparing them for a successful future.
- Library and/or district staff as well as members of the BCRC will analyze the school library resources on an ongoing basis to determine the needs and appropriateness of library materials reporting at least annually to the Chief Academic Officer, the BCRC, and BOE. At a minimum, this includes:
 - Conducting an analysis of the catalog of all materials within the library catalog to determine which of them may require further consideration;
 - Comparing the catalog against an appropriate book list as recommended by the Board Curriculum Review Committee. Any materials identified as potentially concerning will be shared with the Chief Academic Officer who will share with the Board Curriculum Review Committee (BCRC) annually in a library services summary before December 1st of each school year, and as otherwise required when specific library materials are brought up as a concern by a parent/guardian.
 - Purchases may be made from any vendor unless specifically excluded by School Board direction. All suggested material purchases will be approved by the Chief Academic Officer prior to purchase.
 - In the event that materials are provided directly to the school from library services (such as bulk shipments), and not deliberately chosen by the school's library staff, staff will review each item for educational and grade-level appropriateness, and will evaluate the material using the previously referenced resources for flags of sensitive content.
- In the event any materials are determined to be inappropriate based on age level, flags, or lacking educational merit, these materials will be brought to the principal of the school for further consideration. The principal will bring the materials to the Chief Academic Officer who will present the information to the

BCRC which will make a recommendation to the Chief Academic Officer and the Elizabeth School Board of Education. Examples include adding or deleting titles on the sensitive content catalog.

Protocol 2 - Sensitive Content Catalogs

Elizabeth School District will develop and maintain ***sensitive content catalogs according to these protocols and applicable District policy***. This catalog will be created through the review of current materials and review of materials prior to purchase using the BCRC recommended book review sites. The books identified as containing age level sensitive content, will be flagged within Destiny as containing sensitive topics and placed on the Sensitive Topic Catalog list which will be updated throughout the year.

All parents/guardians will be automatically set up to have control over their student's access to materials listed in the sensitive content catalog by the following criteria:

- All parents will automatically receive an email from Destiny when their student checks out a book from the Sensitive Topic Catalog.
- If parents/guardians choose, they may OPT OUT their student from being able to check out any book in the Sensitive Topic Catalog.
- If parents/guardians OPT OUT their student from the Sensitive Topic Catalog, the student will be told by the librarian, "According to your parents, you are not allowed to check out this book."
- The student will be advised that if they want to check out the book, they will need to talk with their parents and have their parents/guardians contact the librarian directly.

Protocol 3 - Parental Access to Library Catalog and Student History

Elizabeth School District recognizes parent/guardian rights and responsibilities as they pertain to the educational system for their students. This requires transparency not only in the process but also in access. Therefore, Elizabeth School District shall maintain open access for parents and guardians to their student's library account through a parental portal as well as full access to the entire school library catalog. This permits parents/guardians to review, at their discretion and convenience, any materials their student is checking out through the school library.

The following protocols outline the process and guidelines for sensitive topic catalogs:

- All materials will be evaluated first with regard to educational merit and attainment of course objectives as they relate to Board-adopted academic standards and as to whether they contain Sensitive Topics as described: graphic violence, sexual content, profanity/obscenity, ideations of self-harm or mental illness, religious viewpoints, drug or excessive alcohol use, racism/discrimination.
- Sensitive Topic Catalogs will exist, and be available upon request.
- Items will be added to the sensitive topic catalog at the school and/or district's discretion based on flags as outlined in Protocol 1.
- Titles not in the sensitive content catalog may be referred to the school or district by parents for consideration and will be evaluated as outlined in Protocol 1.

- District will ensure the Destiny Catalog system issues a pop-up warning when a student attempts to check the material out on a sensitive topic catalog.

Temporarily Suspended Books		
Title	Author	Location
The Hate U Give	Angie Thomas	EMS & EHS
Thirteen Reasons Why	Jay Asher	EMS & EHS
#Pride: Championing LGBTQ Rights	Rebecca Felix	EMS
You Should See Me in a Crown	Leah Johnson	EMS
It's Your World---If You Don't Like It, Change It	Mikki Halpin	EMS
The Kite Runner	Khaled Hosseini	EHS
Beloved	Toni Morrison	EHS
The Bluest Ey	Toni Morrison	EHS
The Perks of Being a Wallflower	Stephen Chbosky	EHS
Looking for Alaska	John Green	EHS
Nineteen Minutes	Jodi Picoult	EHS
Speak	Laurie Anderson	EHS
Identical	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
Fallout	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
Glass	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
Burned	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
Crank	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
Smoke	Ellen Hopkins	EHS
George	Alex Gino	RCE

ESD Sensitive Topic Draft Book List			
Title	Author	School Catalog	Flagged for:
1984 George Orwell	George Orwell	EHS	Graphic Violence
A Clockwork Orange	Anthony Burgess	EHS	Graphic Violence
Anne Frank: Diary of a Young Girl	Anne Frank	EHS	Sexual Content
Ashes to Ashes	Jenny Han and Siobhan Vivian	EHS	Graphic Violence
Assassins	Tim LaHaye and Jerry B. Jenkins	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Athletic Shorts	Chris Crutcher	EHS	Sexual Content
Beloved	Toni Morrison	EHS	Sexual Content
Beyond Magenta - Transgender teens speak out	Susan Kuklin	EHS	Sexual Content
Bhagavad Gita Annotated and Explained	Shri Purohit Swami	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Bhagavad Gita for modern times - secrets to attaining inner peace & harmony	Call # 294.5 BHA	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Bless Me Ultima	Rudolfo Anaya	EHS	Profanity/Obscenity
Bless Me, Ultima	Rudolfo Anaya	EHS	Profanity/Obscenity
Brave New World	Aldous Huxley	EHS	Sexual Content
Brigham Young pioneer prophet	John G. Turner	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Buddhism	Winston King	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Buddhism	Patricia D. Netzley	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Buddhists, Hindus and Sikhs in America	Gurinder Singh Mann	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Burn for Burn	Jenny Han and Siobhan Vivian	EHS	Graphic Violence
Burned	Ellen Hopkins	EHS	Drug or excessive ...
Catcher in the Rye	JD Salinger	EHS	Profanity/Obscenity
Critical Perspectives on Islam and the Western World	JONathan Johansen	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Decoding the past secrets of the Koran	DVD - Hlstory Channel	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Desecration	Tim LaHaye and Jerry B. Jenkins	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Drinking and driving kills	Danielle Dardashti	EHS	Drug or excessive ...
Early Islam	Stewart Desmond	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Eleanor & Park	Rainbow Rowell	EHS	Sexual Content
Empire of the Islamic World	Robin S. Doak	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Ender's Game	Orson Scott Card	EHS	Graphic Violence
Fallen Angels	Walter Dean Myers	EHS	Graphic Violence
Fallen Angels	Walter Dean Meyers	EHS	Profanity/Obscenity
Fire with Fire	Jenny Han and Siobhan Vivian	EHS	Graphic Violence
Gay Power! the Stonewall Riots and the gay rights movement 1969	Betsy Kuhn	EHS	Sexual Content
Glass	Ellen Hopkins	EHS	Drug or excessive ...
Go Ask Alice	Anonymous	EHS	Sexual Content
Hinduism	Gregory Kozlowski	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Hinduism	Madhu Bazaz Wangu	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Hinduism	Thomas Streissguth	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
House of Night (series)	P.C. Cast	EHS	Sexual Content
I know Why the Caged Bird Sings	Maya Angelou	EHS	Sexual Content
I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings	Maya Angelou	EHS	Sexual Content
Inside Mecca	DVD	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Into the Bright Open - A Secret Garden Remix	Cherie Dimaline	EHS	Sexual Content
Islam	Charles Adams	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Islam	Lauri S. Friedman	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Islam empire of faith	Jonathan Grupper	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Islam World Religions	Matthew S. Gordon	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Islamophobia	Dedria Bryfonski	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Joseph Smith	Robert Vincent Remini	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Kaffir Boy	Mark Mathabane	EHS	Sexual Content
Leah on the Offbeat	Becky Albertalli	EHS	Sexual Content
Monster	Walter Dean Meyers	EHS	Graphic Violence
More Than a Carpenter	Josh McDowell	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Mormons in America	Claudia Lauper Bushman	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Night	Elie Wiesel	EHS	Graphic Violence
One Flew Over the Cukoo"s Nest	Ken Kesey	EHS	Sexual Content
Slaughterhouse Five	Kurt Vonnegut	EHS	Graphic Violence
The Remnant	Tim LaHaye and Jerry B. Jenkins	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian	Sherman Alexie	EHS	Sexual Content

The Bluest Eye	Toni Morrison	EHS	Graphic Violence
The book of Mormon - an account written by the hand of Mormon upon plates taken from...	Joseph Smith	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Chocolate War	Robert Cormier	EHS	Profanity/Obscenity
The Color Purple	Alice Walker	EHS	Racism/discrimination
The Color Purple	Alice Walker	EHS	Graphic Violence
The Essence of Buddhism - how to bring spiritual meaning into every day	Carole M. Cusak	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Giver	Lois Lowry	EHS	Ideations of Self-H...
The Handmaid's Tale	Margaret Atwood	EHS	Sexual Content
The Holy Bible	Holy Spirit	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Hunger Games	Suzanne Collins	EHS	Graphic Violence
The Indwelling	Tim LaHaye and Jerry B. Jenkins	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Kite Runner	Khaled Hosseini	EHS	Sexual Content
The Koran	Series - Bantam Classic	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Koran - a very short introduction	Michael Cook	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The Mark	Tim LaHaye and Jerry B. Jenkins	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
The night trilogy - NIGHT, DAWN, DAY	Elie Wiesel	EHS	Graphic Violence
The Perks of Being a Wallflower	Stephen Chbosky	EHS	Sexual Content
The Spread of Islam	John Dunn	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
To Kill a Mockingbird	Harper Lee	EHS	Racism/discrimination
Tokyo Ghoul 7 (NOTE there is an entire series, apparently up to 10)	Sui Ishida	EHS	Graphic Violence
Twilight	Elie Wiesel	EHS	Graphic Violence
Understanding Islam	Beverly A. James	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
Women in Islam	Margaret Speaker Yuan	EHS	Religious Viewpoints
BHA	Jan Thompson	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Anne Frank: Diary of a Young Girl	Anne Frank	EMS	Sexual Content
Averroes (Ibn Rushd): Scholar of Classical and Islamic Philosophy	Bridget Lim	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Being Transgender in America (Part of above series)	Duchess Harris, JD, PhD	EMS	Sexual Content
Buddhism	Anita Ganeri	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Buddhism	Mel Thompson	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Buddhist Festivals Throughout the Year	Anita Ganeri	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Eleanor & Park	Rainbow Rowell	EMS	Sexual Content
Ender's Game	Orson Scott Card	EMS	Graphic Violence
Growing up LGBTQ (PART OF A SERIES: Being LGBTQ in America)	Duchess Harris, JD, PhD	EMS	Sexual Content
Hindu Festivals Throughout the Year	Anita Ganeri	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Hinduism	Das Rasamandala	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Hinduism	Ranchor Prime	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
His Dark Materials Series Bk 1 The Golden Compass	Phillip Pullman	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
House of Night (series)	P.C. Cast	EMS	Sexual Content
Islam	David Self	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Muslim Festivals Throughout the Year	Anita Ganeri	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
My Brother Sam is dead	James Lincoln Collier	EMS	Profanity/Obscenity
Nasreen's Secret School	Jeanette Winter	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
Speak Up!	Rebecca Burgess	EMS	Sexual Content
The Giver	Lois Lowry	EMS	Ideations of Self-H...
The Hunger Games	Suzanne Collins	EMS	Graphic Violence
The Kids Book of World Religions	Jennifer Glossop	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
The King James Bible: Christianity's Definitive Text	Phyllis Corzine	EMS	Religious Viewpoints
To Kill a Mockingbird	Harper Lee	EMS	Racism/discrimination
Zenobia July	Lisa Bunker	EMS	Sexual Content
Bridge to Terabithia	Katherine Patterson	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
Ender's Game	Orson Scott Card	Running Creek	Graphic Violence
House of Night (series)	P.C. Cast	Running Creek	Sexual Content
Noah's Ark	Jerry Pinkney	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
Skippyjon Jones (series)	Judith Schachner	Running Creek	Racism/discrimination
The Camel in the Sun	Griffin Ondaatje	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
The Creation	Stephen Mitchell	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
The Giver	Lois Lowry	Running Creek	Ideations of Self-H...
The proudest blue: a story of hijab and family	Ibitha Muhammad	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
Two by Two	Barbara Reid	Running Creek	Religious Viewpoints
Daughters of Eve - Strong Women of the Bible	Lillian Hammer Ross	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints

Dinner in the Lions' Den	Bob Hartman	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Illustrated dictionary of religions: rituals, beliefs and practices from around the world	Philip Wilkinson	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Noah	Patricia Lee Gauch	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Noah's Ark	CALL# E SPI	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Noah's Ark	Jerry Pinkney	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Ramadan	Kieran Walsh	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Ramadan	Molly Aloian	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
Scary Stories to tell in the Dark	Alvin Schwartz	Singing Hills	Graphic Violence
Skippyjon Jones (series)	Judith Schachner	Singing Hills	Racism/discrimination
The Bible Story (Individual listings for Volumes 1 - 10)	Arthur Maxwell	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The Children's Illustrated Bible	Selina Hastings	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The Christmas Star	Marcus Pfister	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The Giver	Lois Lowry	Singing Hills	Ideations of Self-H...
The Librarian of Basra	Jeanette Winter	Singing Hills	Graphic Violence
The Little Lama of Tibet	Lois Raimondo	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The mysterious visitor - Stories of the Prophet Elijah	Nina Jaffe	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The Stable Where Jesus was Born	Rhonda Gowler Greene	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
The Ten Commandments	Patricia Daniels	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints
What I believe	Alan Brown	Singing Hills	Religious Viewpoints